

# OKLAHOMA LAW REVIEW

## ARTICLES

Inefficient Litigation over Forum: The Unintended  
Consequence of the JVCA’s “Bad Faith” Exception to the Bar  
on Removal of Diversity Cases After One Year *E. Farish Percy*

The Disappointing History of Science in the Courtroom:  
*Frye, Daubert*, and the Ongoing Crisis of “Junk Science”  
in Criminal Trials *Jim Hilbert*

Dispute Resolution Neutrals’ Ethical Obligation  
to Support Measured Transparency *Nancy A. Welsh*

Punishing Families for Being Poor: How Child Protection  
Interventions Threaten the Right to Parent While  
Impoverished *David Pimentel*

## COMMENT

The Duty Dilemma: When the Duty to Mitigate Damages  
and the Duty to Preserve Evidence Collide *Collen L. Steffen*

## NOTES

The Near Impossibility of Pleading Falsity of Opinion  
Statements Under Section 10(b) of the Securities Exchange  
Act and Rule 10b-5 *J. Cooper Davis*

Finding Prejudice from Lost ESI: An Analysis of Courts’  
Standards Under Amended Federal Rule of Civil  
Procedure 37(e) *Thomas J. Joyce*

Except as otherwise expressly provided, the author of each article in this volume has granted permission for copies of that article to be made and used by nonprofit educational institutions, provided that the author and the *Oklahoma Law Review* are identified and that proper notice of the copyright is affixed to each copy. In all other cases, the author and the *Oklahoma Law Review* should be contacted directly.

Cite as: 71 OKLA. L. REV. \_\_\_\_ (2019).

The *Oklahoma Law Review* online edition, ISSN 2473-9111, is edited and compiled at the College of Law of the University of Oklahoma. Copyright January 2019 by the *Oklahoma Law Review*. Manufactured in the United States of America. The *Oklahoma Law Review* is published quarterly and is available online via Digital Commons, Westlaw, Lexis, HeinOnline, and the OLR website, <http://www.law.ou.edu/faculty-and-scholarship/journals/oklahoma-law-review>.

Selected back issues are available electronically free of charge via the *Oklahoma Law Review*'s Digital Commons page, at <http://digitalcommons.law.ou.edu/olr/>.

Editorial office: All editorial communications should be directed by email to [mwaters@ou.edu](mailto:mwaters@ou.edu), or by regular mail to the Editor-in-Chief, *Oklahoma Law Review*, University of Oklahoma College of Law, 300 Timberdell Road, Norman, Oklahoma 73019.

# UNIVERSITY OF OKLAHOMA COLLEGE OF LAW

## ADMINISTRATION

Joseph Harroz, Jr., B.A., J.D., *Dean of the College of Law, Director of the Law Center, Fenelon Boesche Chair in Law, and Professor of Law.*

Andrew M. Coats, B.A., J.D., *Dean Emeritus, Director Emeritus, Samuel Roberts Noble Foundation Presidential Professor, Arch B. & Joanne Gilbert Professor, and Professor of Law.*

Darin K. Fox, B.A., M.S., J.D., *Associate Dean, Director of the Law Library, and Professor of Law.*

Megan Wischmeier Shaner, B.S., J.D., *Associate Dean for Research and Scholarship, and Professor of Law.*

C. Brent Dishman, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean of Student Affairs.*

Stanley L. Evans, B.B.A., M.B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean.*

Gail Mullins, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean of Experiential Learning,, Director of Legal Writing, and Assistant Professor of Law.*

Laura Palk, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean of Development and Alumni AffairsAdjunct Professor of Law*

Kenton Brice, B.B.A., J.D., M.S.-L.S., *Director of Technology Innovation.*

Melissa Caperton, B.A., *Director of Communications.*

David W. Dye, B.A., J.D., M.L.I.S., *Director, Graduate and International Programs.*

Brian Griffith, A.A.S., *Director of Information Technology.*

Peter C. Kraemer, B.A., M.A., M.A., *Director of Faculty Support.*

Autumn Lockett, B.A., *Director of Admissions.*

Ashley Murphy, B.A., M.B.A., J.D., *Director, Office of Career Development.*

Camel Pennington, B.A., J.D., *Director of Annual Giving.*

Glen Pinkston, B.S.B.A., M.A., *Director, Financial Services.*

Stacey Reynolds, B.A., *Director of Continuing Legal Education and Events.*

Sunny Rowland, B.S., J.D., *Director of Academic and Bar Support, and Director of Legal Assistant Education.*

Connie S. Smothermon, B.A., J.D., *Director of Competitions, Director of Externships, and Assistant Director and Assistant Professor of Legal Research & Writing.*

Joel Wegemer, B.A., J.D., M.L.S., *Deputy Director of the Law Library and Adjunct Professor of Law.*

Rachel Egli, B.A., *Editor, Sooner Lawyer, and Communications and Events Coordinator.*

Rebecca J. Lucas, *Registrar and Study Abroad Coordinator.*

Lisa Ross, *Executive Assistant to the Dean.*

Michael F. Waters, B.A., M.A., *Editorial Advisor for the Law Reviews.*

## FACULTY

Owen L. Anderson, B.A., J.D., *Eugene Kuntz Chair in Law in Oil, Gas and Natural Resources Emeritus, George Lynn Cross Research Professor Emeritus, and Professor of Law Emeritus.*

Carolina Arlota, LL.M., J.S.D., *Visiting Assistant Professor of Law.*

Evelyn Aswad, BSFS, J.D., *Herman G. Kaiser Chair in International Law, and Professor of Law.*

Mary Sue Backus, B.A., M.A.T., J.D., *Robert Glenn Rapp Foundation Presidential Professor of Law.*

Brenda H. Barnes, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Clinical Legal Education.*

Donald T. Bogan, A.B., J.D., *Thomas P. Hester Presidential Professor, and Frank Elkouri and Edna Asper Elkouri Professor in Law.*

Sarah Burstein, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law.*

Steven J. Cleveland, B.A., J.D., *Thomas P. Hester Presidential Professor, and Professor of Law.*

Andrew M. Coats, B.A., J.D., *Dean Emeritus, Director Emeritus, Samuel Roberts Noble Foundation Presidential Professor, Arch B. & Joanne Gilbert Professor, and Professor of Law.*

Monika U. Ehrman, B.S., J.D., LL.M., *Faculty Director, Oil & Gas, Natural Resources, and, Energy Center, and Associate Professor of Law.*

Jonathan Forman, B.A., M.A., M.A., J.D., *Kenneth E. McAfee Centennial Chair in Law.*

Darin Fox, B.A., M.S., J.D., *Associate Dean, Director of the Law Library, and Professor of Law.*

Steven S. Gensler, B.S., J.D., *Gene and Elaine Edwards Family Chair in Law, and President's Associates Presidential Professor.*

Mark R. Gillett, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law Emeritus.*

Katheleen Guzman, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Associate Dean for Research and Scholarship, Earl Sneed Centennial Professor, MAPCO/Williams Presidential Professor, and Professor of Law.*

Joseph Harroz, Jr., B.A., J.D., *Dean of the College of Law, Director of the Law Center, Fenelon Boesche Chair in Law, and Professor of Law.*

Taiawagi Helton, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *W. DeVier Pierson Professor of Law, and Professor of Law.*

Stephen E. Henderson, B.S., J.D., *Judge Haskell A. Holloman Professor of Law.*

Eric E. Johnson, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law.*

Kit Johnson, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law.*

Drew Kershen, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Earl Sneed Centennial Professor of Law Emeritus.*

F. Stephen Knippenberg, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Floyd H. and Martha Norris Chair in Law, and Professor of Law.*

Maria T. Kolar, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Visiting Assistant Professor of Law.*

Peter F. Krug, B.A., M.S., Ph.D., J.D., *Herman G. Kaiser Foundation Chair in International Law Emeritus, and Professor of Law Emeritus.*

Peter B. Kutner, A.B., J.D., *Hugh Roff Professor of Law.*

Lubomir P. Litov, B.S., M.S., Ph.D., *Affiliate Associate Professor of Law.*

Brian McCall, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Orpha & Maurice Merrill Professor in Law.*

William J. McNichols, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law Emeritus.*

Erin Means DeWalt, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Legal Research and Writing.*

Roger Michalski, B.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Associate Professor of Law.*

Frederick H. Miller, A.B., J.D., *Professor of Law Emeritus.*

Melissa Mortazavi, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law.*

Gail Mullins, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Dean of Experiential Learning,, Director of Legal Writing, and Assistant Professor of Law.*

Daniel Nicholson, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Legal Research and Writing.*

Christopher Odinet, B.A., J.D., *Affiliate Associate Professor in Entrepreneurship, and Associate Professor of Law*

Joyce Palomar, B.S., M.A., J.D., *Kenneth E. McAfee Chair in Law Emeritus, and Ada Lois Sipuel Fisher Presidential Professor of Law.*

Amy Pepper, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Clinical Education.*

Osborne M. Reynolds, A.B., J.D., LL.M., S.J.D., *Professor of Law Emeritus.*

Robert E.L. Richardson, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law Emeritus.*

Liesia Richter, B.S., J.D., *William J. Alley Professor of Law and Thomas P. Hester Presidential Professor of Law.*

Theodore Roberts, B.S., J.D., *Edith Kinney Gaylord Presidential Professor of Law, and Professor of Law Emeritus.*

Lindsay G. Robertson, A.B., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Faculty Director, Center for the Study of American Indian Law and Policy, Chickasaw Nation Endowed Chair in Native American Law, Sam K. Viersen Jr. Family Foundation Presidential Professor, and Professor of Law.*

Michael A. Scaperlanda, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law Emeritus.*

Zachary M. Schmook, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Legal Research and Writing.*

Megan Wischmeier Shaner, B.S., J.D., *Associate Dean for Research and Scholarship, and Professor of Law.*

Erin Sheley, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., *Professor of Law.*

Connie S. Smothermon, B.A., J.D., *Director of Competitions, Director of Externships, and Assistant Director and Assistant Professor of Legal Research & Writing.*

Robert G. Spector, B.S., J.D., *Glenn R. Watson Centennial Chair in Law, and Professor of Law Emeritus.*

Rennard Strickland, B.A., M.A., J.D., S.J.D., *Senior Scholar in Residence.*

David Swank, B.A., J.D., *Dean Emeritus, and David Ross Boyd Professor of Law Emeritus.*

Murray Tabb, B.A., M.A., J.D., LL.M., *Judge Fred A. Daugherty Chair in Law, and David Ross Boyd Professor of Law.*

Rebekah C. Taylor, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Clinical Legal Education.*

Rick Tepker, B.A., J.D., *Floyd & Irma Calvert Chair of Law and Liberty, and Professor of Law.*

Joseph T. Thai, A.B., J.D., *Presidential Professor of Law, Glenn R. Watson Centennial Chair in Law, and Professor of Law.*

# OKLAHOMA LAW REVIEW

---

EDITED AND COMPILED AT THE COLLEGE OF LAW OF THE UNIVERSITY OF OKLAHOMA  
AND PUBLISHED QUARTERLY  
© Oklahoma Law Review, 2019

---

COLLEN L. STEFFEN  
*Editor-in-Chief*

KATHERINE M. RAUNIKAR  
*Managing Editor*

ALAN FONSECA  
*Executive Articles Editor*

VICTORIA JOHNSON  
ERIC KRAMPF  
ALLISON MEINDERS  
*Note & Comment  
Editors*

JIM JOHN  
WIL NORTON  
ASHLEY RAY  
CHRIS SLOCUM  
PAUL TORTORICI  
SCOTTIE VERPLANK  
*Assistant Managing  
Editors*

PHOEBE MITCHELL  
*Research Editor &  
Candidate Mentor*

JAKE MARTIN  
ASHLYN SMITH  
MATT STOTT  
*Judiciary Committee*

SARAH K. CAPPS  
ANTHONY W. JOYCE  
THOMAS J. JOYCE  
*Articles Editors*

HAYLEY PARKER  
*Symposium Editor*

BECKY BRYAN  
COOPER DAVIS  
JAKE MARTIN  
MAEGAN MURDOCK  
SHELBY RICE  
MATT STOTT  
*Assistant Articles Editors*

SHELBY RICE  
*Topic Editor  
& Candidate Mentor*

AMANDA BROUSSARD  
CHRIS SLOCUM  
*Staff Editors*

## MEMBERS

CONNOR L. BALLINGER  
BRENNAN T. BARGER  
BAILEY BETZ  
JACOB P. BLACK  
RYAN D. BROWN  
EVAN J. CRUMPLEY  
DIANE DOH  
JACOB M. DOWNS  
COOPER E. EPPES  
MARCI J. GRACEY  
NATALIE M. JESTER  
KARSON J. KATZ  
MAEVE P. LINDSEY  
MICAH G. MAHDI  
JUSTIN M. MAI  
NICK MARR

MATTHEW T. NEIMAN  
TAYLOR J. FREEMAN PESHEHONOFF  
JONATHAN L. ROGERS  
GRANT P. SCOWDEN  
AUSTIN SHEEHY  
HEATHER S. TALLEY  
ISAAC Z. TREADAWAY  
REED C. TRECHTER  
GRAYSON P. WALKER  
SEAN C. WALLIS  
JOSEPH D. WEISS  
COURTNEY D. WEST  
SIERRA L. WHITE  
ALLYSON L. WILCOX  
ABBEY D. ZUECH

# OKLAHOMA LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 71

SPRING 2019

NUMBER 3

## ARTICLES

Inefficient Litigation over Forum: The Unintended  
Consequence of the JVCA's "Bad Faith" Exception  
to The Bar on Removal of Diversity Cases After One Year  
*E. Farish Percy* 595

The Disappointing History of Science in the Courtroom:  
*Frye, Daubert*, and the Ongoing Crisis of "Junk Science"  
in Criminal Trials  
*Jim Hilbert* 759

Dispute Resolution Neutrals' Ethical Obligation to Support  
Measured Transparency  
*Nancy A. Welsh* 823

Punishing Families for Being Poor: How Child Protection  
Interventions Threaten the Right to Parent While Impoverished  
*David Pimentel* 885

## COMMENT

The Duty Dilemma: When the Duty to Mitigate Damages  
and the Duty to Preserve Evidence Collide  
*Collen L. Steffen* 923

## NOTES

The Near Impossibility of Pleading Falsity of Opinion  
Statements Under Section 10(b) of the Securities Exchange  
Act and Rule 10b-5  
*J. Cooper Davis* 959

Finding Prejudice from Lost ESI: An Analysis of Courts'  
Standards Under Amended Federal Rule of Civil Procedure  
37(e)  
*Thomas J. Joyce* 979