

American Indian Law Review

Volume 29 | Number 2

1-1-2005

Book Review: John W. W. Mann, *Sacajawea's People: The Lemhi Shoshones and the Salmon River Country*, University of Nebraska Press, 2004

Jari D. Barnett

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.law.ou.edu/air>



Part of the [Indigenous, Indian, and Aboriginal Law Commons](#), [Indigenous Studies Commons](#), and the [Legal History Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Jari D. Barnett, *Book Review: John W. W. Mann, Sacajawea's People: The Lemhi Shoshones and the Salmon River Country*, University of Nebraska Press, 2004, 29 AM. INDIAN L. REV. 443 (2005), <https://digitalcommons.law.ou.edu/air/vol29/iss2/10>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by University of Oklahoma College of Law Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in American Indian Law Review by an authorized editor of University of Oklahoma College of Law Digital Commons. For more information, please contact Law-LibraryDigitalCommons@ou.edu.

BOOK REVIEW

*Jari D. Barnett**

John W.W. Mann, *Sacajawea's People: The Lemhi Shoshones and the Salmon River Country*, University of Nebraska Press, 2004.

The Sacajawea coin was minted in 1999 by the United States Mint as part of the bicentennial celebration of the Lewis and Clark expedition and the Corps of Discovery. The bicentennial celebration of Sacajawea's aid of Lewis and Clark provides the perfect time to consider the future of the Lemhi Shoshone people. John W. W. Mann has created a readable narrative giving the history and struggle of the Lemhi Shoshone to regain their traditional lands, the Salmon River Country. As a springboard for the story, Mann points to the Sacajawea \$1 coin as an illustration of the lack of knowledge concerning the Lemhi Shoshone people. The author describes how the use of a non-Lemhi Shoshone woman for the Sacajawea coin and an incorrect depiction of the baby in a blanket rather than on a cradleboard created anger in the Lemhi Shoshone people, but little reaction in popular culture. This work is the product of the author's research into the petition of the Lemhi Shoshone for federal recognition and the continued insensitive treatment of Sacajawea's people.

Mann begins by placing the Lemhi Shoshones in both geographic and social context. The author paints a picture of the Lemhi Shoshones in the remote Salmon River country ("River of No Return") in Idaho. Once firmly established in the physical area, Mann shows the depth of his historical research and traces the beginning of the Lemhi Shoshone people using archeology. According to the author, traditional knowledge reinforces the intrinsic link of the Lemhi Shoshone to the Salmon River region, placing this people in the county from the time of creation. By the time of the arrival of Lewis and Clark Mann describes how the Lemhi Shoshone had united into a single political entity, which served them well as the tribe's physical, cultural, and political space dwindled with the encroachment of non-Indian peoples.

Removal and the Implications of the Lemhi Shoshone time at Fort Hall

Mann outlines the path to removal during the nineteenth century. Mann traces the depletion of the natural resources relied upon by the Lemhi

* Third-year student, University of Oklahoma College of Law.

Shoshone as one reason for the move of the Tribe onto a small reservation, then follows this story with the full scale removal to Fort Hall in 1907. The author notes that the settlement terms of the reservation liquidation, which called for annuities, resulted in tension between the United States government and the Lemhi Shoshone. Mann outlines the maneuvers of the Tribe to regain the Salmon River lands from which they were removed during the early to mid twentieth century. Mann explains the establishment of the Lemhi Commission. This Commission was established to address the surplus money, which Mann explains was returned to the United States Treasury. The author points out that while only one Lemhi actually testified in front of the Commission, the Commission explored the treatment of the Lemhi Shoshone at Fort Hall and researched the status of monies which were owed to the individuals of the Lemhi Shoshone. Mann establishes that while the Lemhi pressured the Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) and gained payment to individual members, the surplus was split between several tribes at Fort Hall. In 1939, the government compiled a census of the Lemhi Shoshone people. However, Mann points out that during the fight for annuities, a determination had been made that the Lemhi Shoshone would not gain exclusive access to the monies as the BIA could not distinguish between the Lemhi and other tribes at Fort Hall. In particular, Mann states, the BIA and other entities began to combine the Lemhi Shoshone with the Shoshone-Bannock Tribes. The author determined that this combination to two tribes at Fort Hall would have implications for the Lemhi Shoshone in the court cases to come.

The Lemhi Shoshone's Court Battles During the Era of Termination

Termination, a movement to remove federal supervision from tribes, brought an entirely new stress to American Indian tribes. Mann illustrates the how the Shoshone used the court system in the form of the Indian Claims Commission to argue that their lands had been wrongfully seized. The process was slow, generally cases were heard in the three stages of title, value-liability, and offsets. The title phase required proof, usually from ethnologists, of the exclusive occupancy of the land in question. Mann paints a picture of how the trials the Lemhi Shoshone faced helped maintain the identity of the people. The Lemhi Shoshone revisited their past, sustaining the vision that the Lemhi were, in fact, a distinct group of people. Mann details the struggle, which pit two well known anthropologists, Julian Steward and Omer Stewart against one another. Eventually, the ICC ruled in favor of the Lemhi Shoshone, and the tribe was awarded a settlement offer. Mann then follows the aftermath of the award, which created even more confusion. The author

outlines how the wording of the award allowed all tribes at Fort Hall a right to the award money. When a vote was held at Fort Hall, the settlement offer was accepted against Lemhi opposition. Following this acceptance, Mann details the Lemhi's attempt to reverse the decision and gain control over their money to no avail. Through this political turmoil, the Lemhi remained tied to Salmon Country. Mann vividly illustrates how the Lemhi Shoshone returned to their lands from Fort Hall. The influx of people, sometime seasonal and sometime permanent, into the Salmon area impacted the relationships toward the land and the non-Indian community of Salmon. Mann points out that the Lemhi people often found employment in the non-Indian town and that the re-establishment of the Lemhi Shoshone village was accomplished on land provided for by non-Indians. Most importantly, the author shows how the Lemhi Shoshone, by absolute fortitude, kept their ties with the land. The Lemhi utilized the traditional knowledge in the areas of hunting, fishing, and gathering to enable a life in the Indian village. Mann points out that for many Lemhi, life in the village was preferable to life elsewhere. However, over time, the numbers of tribal members dwindled in the Lemhi village, until finally, Mann tells that the village area transformed to a park and fishing pond in the early 1990s.

Treaty Rights

Despite the eventual decline of the Indian village at Salmon, the Lemhi Shoshone retained important treaty rights. Of particular importance, was the right to fish for the salmon, the river's namesake. Mann describes how the increased fishing combined with decreasing fish numbers in the later twentieth century, again embroiled the Lemhi in controversy. Mann paints a human face on the controversy and follows the story of Gerald Tinno, a Lemhi Shoshone descendant who served as the flashpoint in the case, the *State of Idaho v. Tinno*, 497 P.2d 1386 (Id. 1972). The author describes how the Lemhi trace their right to fish and hunt to the Bridger Treaty, dated July 3, 1868. Tinno's straight point fishing spear and his catch of the day were confiscated in July 1968 by a game warden along Eightmile Creek. Mann discusses how the case arguments centered around the language of the treaty granting the "right to hunt on unoccupied lands of the United States" The Lemhi argued that the right to hunt implied a right to fish, that in the Shoshone language, hunt included both hunting for game on land and fishing. The straight point spear used by Tinno, was a traditional means of fishing for the Lemhi people. The straight point spear had first been recorded by Clark in 1805, and later by missionaries in 1855. Mann discusses its use and description in these various

historical contexts and make clear Tinno was seemingly employing traditional fishing methods. While Tinno has the misfortune to be the name most associated with salmon fishing rights cases, Mann outlines how salmon harvesting by tribal members and non-Indians has been a point of contention almost since the first interaction between the two cultures. By the 1990s, dams and other limitations on the river systems of Idaho had reduced the salmon population by about 95%, however Mann illustrates that much of the blame was put on Lemhi traditional fishing practices. Mann details that in *Tinno*, while the court found that fishing rights of individuals are subject to state conservation rights, those limitations were pre-empted by the Federal Treaty. The author states that the judge found the word hunt in the Bridgerton Treaty implicitly included the right to fish.

Sacajawea's People

Mann ends his fascinating journey of the Lemhi Shoshone by setting forth the continued battles for federal recognition and land reclamation. While the Lemhi struggle for independence apart from the Shoshone Bannock Tribe, the author emphasizes the unique opportunity the government faces with the Lewis and Clark Bicentennial celebrations. Mann states that just as the Corps of Discovery returned Sacajawea to her people, government promises of self-determination necessitate the official recognition of the Lemhi Shoshone.

John W. W. Mann provides an intellectual and fascinating narrative of the Lemhi Shoshone fight for the return of their lands and federal recognition. The author's illustrations of the traditions and culture of the Lemhi Shoshone confirm the existence of a unique people and makes evident the uphill battle many tribes face today in the federal recognition process. *Sacajawea's People: The Lemhi Shoshones and the Salmon River Country* is an eminently readable book and will enhance the bookshelf of scholars and lay people alike who have an interest in the Corps of Discovery and Federal Indian recognition.